Illegal wildlife trade: context and solutions

Steven Broad
Executive Director
TRAFFIC
the wildlife trade monitoring network
TRAFFIC: wildlife trade specialists
KEY MESSAGES:

• Illegal wildlife trade is big, complex and harmful

• The underlying problem is over-exploitation of wildlife, driven by demand

• Diverse, well-designed solutions are needed to address the immediate problems of wildlife trade crime

• Success depends on wider environmental action – local engagement and responsible consumption
Table 3: Economic Values of Illegal Trade of Renewable Natural Resources ($ billions/year)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Renewable Natural Resources Sector Values</th>
<th>Lower Estimate</th>
<th>Upper Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Financial or Market Value (Provisioning Services)</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Illegal Logging</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Illegal Fishing</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Illegal Wildlife</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Economic Value of Regulating &amp; Cultural Ecosystem Services</td>
<td>839</td>
<td>1,737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Illegal Logging (incl. carbon seq.)</td>
<td>838</td>
<td>1,736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Illegal Fishing</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Illegal Wildlife Trade</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Economic Value</td>
<td>887</td>
<td>1,953</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SCALE OF ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: TENS OF THOUSANDS OF SPECIES TRADED GLOBALLY
COMPLEXITY OF ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: GLOBAL REACH

Wildlife Trafficking Air Routes 2009-2016: Elephant Ivory, Rhino Horn, Live Birds & Live Reptiles
COMPLEXITY OF ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: GLOBAL REACH

Wildlife seizure heatmaps: origin and destination (TRAFFIC WiTIS)
Estimated annual ivory exports from Africa 1500-2020 and trends in likely end markets (t)

Historical data from Parker, 1979

Note: 50 year time blocks mask short peaks – eg US peaked 1900-1914; India increased again 1915-1940
Direct exploitation is a major cause of species decline and is often, though not always, driven by trade, which is sometimes illegal.
IMPACTS OF ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: BEYOND NATURE

Harms from illegal wildlife trade extend beyond the direct impacts on nature, including:

• declining natural capital
• lost revenue from legal exploitation
• undermining local livelihoods
• Insecurity and instability
• health problems
• attracting organised crime and corruption
Global illicit markets thrive in the shadows of the global economy. Due to the clandestine nature of illicit transactions, the profits from illicit trade are hard to estimate. Data is accessed through seizures, law enforcement data and cross-comparisons with parallel legal markets.

**A global Challenge**

While the profits are hard to quantify, the harmful impacts on consumers, the environment, tax revenues and jobs are apparent in all societies. Traffic areas such as humans and narcotics exact a very heavy toll on societies. Illicit trade is also linked to criminal violence and even the financing of terrorism. Illicit trade can cause longer-term damage to the rule of law, public trust, human capital and public health, as well as deter foreign investment due to its close linkages with corruption.

For more information on the OECD Task Force on Countering Illicit Trade, and to read the full 2016 Report: Converging Criminal Networks, click here.
### Skin and Bones Unresolved

An Analysis of Tiger Seizures from 2000 - 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Seizures</th>
<th>Number of Tigers Seized</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myanmar</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside Tiger's Range</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>463</td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Commodities

- Skin: 40%
- Whole: 29%
- Parts: 27%
- Others: 4%

Traffic

The Worldwide Traffic Network
### White-Rumped Shama Seizures 2008 - 2018

**A total of 15,480 birds in 432 seizures**

#### International Seizures

- **10,376 birds** from international trade in 12% of all seizures

#### Birds Seized by Country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Seizures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>7,373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>6,838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>1,174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Based on Year

- 2010
- 2018
ILLEGAL ABALONE TRADE

Despite numerous diverse interventions over the last 17 years, trade in illegally harvested abalone has continued unabated.

96 MILLION
Total number of individual abalone poached, 2006–2016

90%
of exports are destined for Hong Kong SAR

43%
of illegal harvest being exported through sub-Saharan nations

98%
of all dried abalone reached Hong Kong SAR by air

ZAR628,000,000
Annual average value of poached abalone

2,174 TONNES
Average mass of abalone poached per year, 2000–2016

On average, at least one abalone seizure occurred per day between 2000–2016

RECOMMENDATIONS SUMMARY

NATIONAL COLLABORATION
Local, multi-agency collaboration across social, economic, and environmental agencies to address complex factors influencing poaching and trade

TRADE REGULATIONS
International trade controls in the form of a CITES listing

TRACEABILITY SYSTEMS
Legal abalone traders are encouraged to develop a robust traceability system for all abalone products exported from South Africa

REGIONAL COLLABORATION
Within sub-Saharan Africa to reduce exports of illegal harvest through South Africa's sub-Saharan states
THE UNDERLYING PROBLEM IS DEMAND THAT DRIVES OVER-EXPLOITATION OF NATURE

from the needs and aspirations of people to make a living from the natural resources around them

right through to consumers who have the financial means to purchase wildlife commodities to fulfil a range of needs and desires
Legislation and regulation have been the main responses to the problem of over-exploitation over the past 50 years – there have been successes, but it’s clear – making something illegal does not stop it happening.
DESIGNING THE FIGHT AGAINST ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: A CRIME PREVENTION APPROACH

INCREASE EFFORT

INCREASE RISKS

REDUCE REWARDS

REDUCED ILLEGAL TRADE

REDUCED MOTIVATION FOR CRIMINAL INVOLVEMENT IN ILLEGAL TRADE

INCREASE THE EFFORT ILLEGAL TRADERS NEED TO MAKE

INCREASE THE INDIRECT AND DIRECT RISKS FOR ILLEGAL TRADERS

REDUCE THE REWARDS FOR ILLEGAL TRADERS

LOCAL COMMUNITIES CHANGING attitude to engage in poaching and illegal trade

GOVERNMENT STRENGTHENS antipoaching law enforcement

BUSINESSES WHOSE SUPPLY CHAINS ARE AT RISK PROFITABLY close opportunities for illegal trade

OPPORTUNITIES AND INCENTIVES FOR CRIMINALS INGOVERNMENT AND PRIVATE SECTOR ARE REDUCED

GOVERNMENTS STRENGTHEN LEGISLATION, REGULATION AND JUDICIAL ACTION

CONSUMERS BUY LESS ILLEGAL WILDLIFE

SITUATIONAL CRIME PREVENTION

SECOND EDITION

SUCCESSFUL CASE STUDIES

RonalD v. clarke

editor

STOP ILLEGAL EXPLOITATION:

Supporting law protection, including by strengthening community incentives for protection

STOP TRAFFICKING:

Supporting actions to reduce illegal wildlife trade

2.1 SOURCING

Engage and support preventative action by transport, Internet, finance and other corruption

2.2 REGULATION

Develop and fine-tune tools and approaches that help undermine corruption

2.3 REGULATION

Strengthen and support legislation and regulatory approaches

2.4 REGULATION

Moderate, inform and support enforcement and judicial action

2.5 PURCHASING

Inform, catalyse and support social and behavioural change to reduce desire/demand

STOP THE BUYING:

Inform and moderate intergovernmental policy interventions, evaluate progress and ensure accountability

International Policy Pressure:

Mobilising supportive intergovernmental engagement

COMPLEMENTARY ACTION BY OTHERS

COMPLEMENTARY ACTION BY OTHERS

COMPLEMENTARY BEHAVIOURAL CHANGE CAMPAIGNING BY OTHERS
The Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online

34 company partners across Americas, Asia, Europe and Africa
ACTION ON ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: INCREASE RISKS
### ACTION ON ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE: REDUCE REWARDS

#### Reducing Demand for Illegal Wildlife Products

Research indicates that reducing illegal wildlife product consumer behavior is crucial. Various strategies target different aspects of consumer behavior, such as reducing the demand for ivory.

#### Key Drivers and Deterrents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Deterrents</th>
<th>Drivers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am concerned about the possible extinction of elephants</td>
<td>5.95</td>
<td>5.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing ivory participates in animal cruelty</td>
<td>5.65</td>
<td>5.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I share information about animal protection on social media</td>
<td>5.60</td>
<td>5.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I saw someone selling ivory, I would report it to the authorities</td>
<td>5.56</td>
<td>5.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I try to convince my friends and family not to buy ivory</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>5.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am concerned about the legal consequences of buying ivory</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>5.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ivory that comes from a killed elephant brings bad luck</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My friends or family asked me not to buy ivory</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory has great ornamental value</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is unique</td>
<td>5.38</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Only a strong law and penalties will prevent me from buying ivory</td>
<td>5.38</td>
<td>5.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I cannot afford ivory</td>
<td>5.35</td>
<td>5.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am afraid to buy counterfeited ivory</td>
<td>5.35</td>
<td>5.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory increases its value over time</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory connects me to my cultural heritage</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I buy ivory and know it is reliable</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is a gift to mark special life events</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is a souvenir to buy when I’m on holiday abroad</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory brings luck and fortune</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is a present to pass to future generations</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory is a symbol of wealth, power and social status</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory gifts help to build business relationships</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivory has healing powers and brings good health</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I always want to buy ivory</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Note

A driver is a motivating factor to a buyer, whereas a deterrent is an inhibiting factor to buying. The order of these results indicates the relative strength of people’s opinions.
ASSESSING IMPACT OF ACTIONS TO ADDRESS ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE

**A. SUPPLY FLOW**
- 1. Producer incentive modification
- 2. In situ protection

**B. TRADING FLOWS**
- 3. Trade regulation
- 4. Trade chain disruption

**C. END MARKET FLOW**
- 5. End market regulation
- 6. Consumer behaviour modification

**D. DEMAND**

**INCREASE EFFORT REQUIRED**

**INCREASE RISKS**

**REDUCE BENEFITS**

**STATUS**

IUCN/SSC DATABASE
CITES-ETIS
PRICE DATA
MARKET SURVEY
CONSUMER SURVEY
Interventions to address illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade

Livelihoods as driver

- Diversifying harvester livelihoods reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Increasing harvester income reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Consumer awareness campaigns reduce the volume of wildlife consumed

Awareness as driver

- Increasing harvester/trader awareness reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade

Markets & prices as driver

- Consumer demand for wildlife products is responsive to changes in retail price
- Supply of wildlife products to and through the market is responsive to changes in producer price and profitability

Laws & regulations as driver

- The imposition of restrictions and penalties reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Increasing community access rights over land and resources reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade

Resource management as driver

- External support to improved resource management reduces overexploitation

Setting Wildlife Trade Action in a Wider Context

- Diversifying harvester livelihoods reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Increasing harvester income reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Consumer awareness campaigns reduce the volume of wildlife consumed
- Increasing harvester/trader awareness reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- The imposition of restrictions and penalties reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
- Increasing community access rights over land and resources reduces illegal & unsustainable wildlife trade
LOCAL COMMUNITIES HAVE A VITAL ROLE TO PLAY

Local communities: the overlooked first line of defence for wildlife

The voices of local communities living with wildlife have been missing from policy debates on the illegal wildlife trade (IWT). National, regional and international policy forums must include community representatives as equal partners alongside government and non-government stakeholders if policy is to be effective in practice.

Increasing community incentives for wildlife stewardship (in policy and practice) and decreasing the costs of living with wildlife could provide a much-needed boost to efforts to combat IWT. The First Line of Defence (FLoD) initiative is an approach that directly engages with the communities that are targeted by IWT projects, seeking to understand and give voice to their perspectives. Critically, the initiative explores the extent to which communities align (or not) with the perspectives of those who design and implement IWT projects and those who set policy.
People Not Poaching
The Communities and IWT Learning Platform

Supporting and engaging communities as the first line of defence against illegal wildlife trade

Learn more
GLOBAL WILDLIFE PROGRAMME
COMMUNITY-LEVEL INVESTMENTS
DEVELOPING CREATIVE SOLUTIONS TO WILDLIFE OVER-EXPLOITATION

**Action to enhance systems for sustainable, legal wildlife trade**

Work is focused on enhancing benefits from sustainable and legal trade in wildlife resources by increasing incentives and pathways for businesses, communities and consumers to engage in responsible trade practices.

**Action to enhance responses to wildlife crime and illegal trade**

Work is focused on achieving a sustained reduction in illegal wildlife trade by increasing the risks and reducing the rewards associated with trading in wildlife contraband, reducing criminal motivation and engagement in the illicit trade that is driving the poaching crisis.
COMMUNITY-BASED SUSTAINABLE WILD PLANT HARVEST

wild harvested plant-based products sourcing
FairWild certification and implementation projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wild harvested plant-based products sourcing</th>
<th>FairWild certification and implementation projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Throat Coat</td>
<td>![Image of Throat Coat product]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGANIC</td>
<td>![Image of ORGANIC product]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juniper Green Limited Dry Gin</td>
<td>![Image of Juniper Green Limited Dry Gin product]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peppermint &amp; Liquorice</td>
<td>![Image of Peppermint &amp; Liquorice product]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposed</td>
<td>![Image of Exposed product]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Harvest of wild plants can provide vital resources for poor and marginalised people and much-needed income. It can also provide an incentive to manage the harvest of plants sustainably and to maintain their habitat to **the benefit of other species and whole ecosystems.**
KEY MESSAGES:

• Illegal wildlife trade is big, complex and harmful

• The underlying problem is over-exploitation of wildlife, driven by demand

• Diverse, well-designed solutions are needed to address the immediate problems of wildlife trade crime

• Success depends on wider environmental action – local community engagement and more attention to responsible consumption globally
Illegal wildlife trade: context and solutions

Steven Broad
Executive Director

COMBATING ILLEGAL WILDLIFE TRADE – A CIVIL SOCIETY PERSPECTIVE